

## Minutes of a meeting of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee held on Thursday, 8 December 2022 in Committee Room 1 - City Hall, Bradford

Commenced 5.00 pm  
Concluded 8.30 pm

### Present – Councillors

LABOUR	CONSERVATIVE	LIBERAL DEMOCRAT
Azam Nazir D Green Mohammed Regan	Nazam Loy	Stubbs

Apologies: Councillor Arshad Hussain and Councillor Joan Clarke

### Councillor Azam in the Chair

#### 42. DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

No disclosures of interest in matters under consideration were received.

#### 43. MINUTES

Resolved –

That the minutes of the meetings held on 13 and 25 October 2022 be signed as a correct record.

***ACTION: Director of Legal & Governance***

#### 44. INSPECTION OF REPORTS AND BACKGROUND PAPERS

There were no appeals submitted by the public to review decisions to restrict documents.

#### 45. REFERRALS TO THE OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

There were no referrals made to the Committee.

#### **46. TENDER FOR MICROSOFT ENTERPRISE AGREEMENT (RENEWAL)**

The Strategic Director Corporate Resources submitted a report (**Document “Y”**) which outlined the basis to go out to tender under the Crown Commercial Services Framework RM6068, Lot 3 – Technology Products & Associated Services (TePAS), to renew our Microsoft Enterprise Agreement for 3 years and to price lock the products included in the agreement.

It was stated that the current agreement with Microsoft will run out in March 2023 and the report set out the rationale for the tender based on the current user profile, with a plus or minus reduction invoice generated based on the number of users.

In response to a number of questions around reducing costs, alternative providers in the market and whether a better value for money agreement could be negotiated, it was stated that if there were less users then there would be a cost saving as we would be invoiced on the number of net users. It was stressed that the current contract had provided good value for money and enabled the roll out of updated software across the IT network, and that through the tendering exercise the best priced tender will be considered.

**Resolved –**

**That the Head of IT, begin the tender process using Crown Commercial Services Framework RM6068, Lot 3 – Technology Products & Associated Services (TePAS) for the renewal of the Microsoft M365 E3 licence for a period of 3 years and award the contract to the winning bidder and approve the spend and caveats as outlined in Document “Y” under section 4, so that the Microsoft Enterprise Agreement can be renewed before April 2023.**

***ACTION: Strategic Director Corporate Resources***

#### **47. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**

**Resolved –**

**That the public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of the substantive matter and in particular Appendix 2 relating to Bradford Community Safety Partnership – Performance Report on the grounds that it is likely in view of the nature of the business to be transacted or the nature of the proceedings, that if they were present, exempt information within Paragraph 7 (Crime Prevention) of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 (as amended), would be disclosed and it is considered that, in all the circumstances, the public interest in excluding public access to the relevant part of the proceedings outweighs the interest in publication of the report.**

**48. BRADFORD DISTRICT COMMUNITY SAFETY PARTNERSHIP PERFORMANCE REPORT AND DELIVERY PLAN**

The Community Safety Partnership Board submitted a report (**Document “V” including Not for Publication Appendix 2**) which provided an annual performance report summary for the twelve months to 30th September 2022 and presents the annual Delivery Plan.

As the substantive discussion focused around the information contained in the Not for Publication Appendix 2, the whole report was considered in exempt session.

**Resolved –**

- (1) That the Bradford District Community Safety Partnership Performance Report and Delivery Plan be noted.**
- (2) That the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee receives a progress report every six months.**

***ACTION: Strategic Director Place***

**49. HATE CRIME SCRUTINY REVIEW**

The Strategic Director Place submitted a report (**Document “W”**) which provided an update to the recommendations from the findings from the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review.

The progress made on the actions identified in the Review were alluded to and detailed in the report. Although disability groups were being supported and these arrangements were working well, contact with the Morley Street Resource centre had not been established, however efforts were continuing in order to further help this community going forward.

Around 24 reporting centres had been established across the district, with training being provided.

A one stop shop had been established offering victim support and communities that were previously not engaging were now coming forward to access help and report incidents.

The use of an App and other IT enhancements was also assisting in reporting and logging incidents.

During the discussion a Member stated that although there was good anecdotal evidence of the progress being made as had been outlined, the report did not contain any benchmarking data, and this was disappointing. In response it was stated that much of the feedback received was based on satisfaction and that the data sets needed some additional work, as reporting of hate crime still remained an issue.

A Member ascertained that a number of years had passed since the Hate Crime

Scrutiny Review was undertaken, and how was progress being measured against the terms of reference set by this Committee. It was acknowledged that further work needed to be done to ensure better reporting of hate crime and that underreporting had led to mainly anecdotal evidence being presented.

A previous Member and Deputy Chair of the Committee also reiterated his concerns around the lack of data presented in the report and where progress had been made it was difficult to see how tangible this was, so many of the recommendations made by this Committee were difficult to measure progress against. In response the Assistant Director Neighbourhoods acknowledged the concerns expressed by Members. It was added that sharing experiences between partners was key in identifying issues and then capturing this information in any future data reporting.

**Resolved –**

- (1) That the work by Bradford Hate Crime Alliance (BHCA) to meet the actions identified in the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review be endorsed.**
- (2) That a more detailed response to the recommendations contained in Document “W”, particularly in terms of some of the specific measures taken to reduce hate crime, be provided to Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee in three months’ time.**

***ACTION: Strategic Director Place***

**50. BRADFORD FOR EVERYONE STRATEGY (2018 - 2023) BUILDING STRONGER COMMUNITIES TOGETHER**

The Strategic Director Place submitted a report (**Document “X”**) which provided a summary of the Bradford for Everyone Strategy and as well as an update on the Integration Area pilot which ran under the title of “Bradford for Everyone” between 2019-2022. With a focus on learning and legacy from this ‘test and learn’ style programme.

A number of project ambassadors were present at the meeting and they gave a flavour and account of how the Strategy had enabled them to gain qualifications and training which had transformed their lives and the lives of their families.

Members of the Committee commended the ambassadors for their insights and that it gave real life tangible examples of the work done through the Strategy.

A Member ascertained what work was being done to support better community cohesion between different communities. In response it was stated that work was ongoing to share common values, empathy as common strands and thereby bridge differences between different communities.

In response to a question regarding evaluation, it was stressed that sharing information was key and being honest as to what works. To this end a lot work had been done regarding sharing the evaluation report.

**Resolved –**

- (1) That the success, progress, learning and legacy of Bradford**

**District's Integration Area pilot programme "Bradford for Everyone" (BfE) – delivered by Stronger Communities and the recommendations of the evaluation of it be noted.**

- (2) That a progress report against the Bradford for Everyone Strategy (2018-2023) be presented to Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee in 12 months' time.**

***ACTION: Strategic Director Place***

## **51. THE STONEWALL WORKPLACE EQUALITIES INDEX SUBMISSION**

The Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee, in the meeting on the 13 October 2022, requested a further report on the Stonewall Workplace Equalities Index submission. The Committee requested that the report should specifically focus on the process; costs relating to the submission; details of the reasons for the Stonewall submission; questionnaire details and methodology; and responses to the Stonewall report. The Director of Human Resources submitted a report (**Document "Z"**) which provided the details requested by this Committee.

During the discussion, a Member expressed his reservations regarding the policy relating to Trans Equality and Gender Identity and how and when this policy was adopted, in particular the use of female toilets and changing rooms by anyone who identified themselves as belonging to that sex; and that he was not aware that Members had made a change to this policy. He further highlighted that this could potentially put women in danger.

The Human Resources Director explained some of the rationale behind the policy as well as the consultation that had taken with the LGBTQ staff group, however people were able to use their respective gender identified spaces.

The Chair stated that notwithstanding the concerns expressed further updates on LGBTQ+ representation should be provided as part of wider qualities reporting and updates presented to the Committee, which includes the policy on transgender and equality and safety of women, otherwise the work of this Committee could become too onerous.

The Member who raised the concerns insisted that clarification be sought from the Director of Human Resources on how the policy relating to Trans Equality and Gender Identity was adopted, particularly in terms of the level of consultation undertaken with Elected Members, and in addition the relevant Portfolio Holder and Strategic Director be instructed to put a hold on the policy relating to Trans Equality and Gender Identity, until further consideration is given due to the impact on the public using council facilities, and it was therefore:

**Resolved –**

- (1) That the contents of Document "Z" to the report be noted and that**

further updates on LGBTQ+ representation be provided as part of wider equalities reporting and updates presented to the Committee, which includes the policy on transgender and equality and safety of women.

- (2) That clarification be sought from the Director of Human Resources on how the policy relating to Trans Equality and Gender Identity was adopted, particularly in terms of the level of consultation undertaken with Elected Members, and that this be circulated to Members of the Committee at the earliest opportunity.
- (3) That subject to the clarification at recommendation 2, this Committee considers recommending to the relevant Portfolio Holder that the Strategic Director be instructed to put a hold on the policy relating to Trans Equality and Gender Identity, until further consideration is given due to the impact on the public using council facilities.

***ACTION: Human Resources Director***

Chair

**Note: These minutes are subject to approval as a correct record at the next meeting of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee.**